

No. P-17024/58/2011-RC
Government of India
Ministry of Rural Development

Krishi Bhavan, New Delhi
Dated 9th April, 2012

Subject: Meeting of the Empowered Committee held on 22nd March, 2012 under the chairmanship of Secretary (RD) – Minutes thereon.

A copy of the Minutes of the Meeting of the Empowered Committee held on 22nd March, 2012 to consider the project proposals for Missing Bridges on already sanctioned roads, Left out habitations under Bharat Nirman (Dhule, Nandurbar & Nashik) and for New Connectivity for Habitations of 800-999 population category for Phase-X (2012-13) under PMGSY sent by the Government of Maharashtra is forwarded for necessary action.

(S R Meena) 09/4/12
Director (RC)

Ph:011-23074307/23381251-Fax

Distribution:-

1. Shri Sudhir Thakre, Secretary, Rural Development & Panchayati Raj, Government of Maharashtra, Mumbai-400032. 15590/2012
2. Principal Adviser (Transport), Planning Commission, Yojana Bhavan, New Delhi. 15593/2012
3. Director, Central Road Research Institute, Mathura Road, New Delhi. 15595/2012
4. Chief Engineer, Road Standards & Research, Ministry of Surface Transport & Highways, Transport Bhavan, New Delhi. 15596/2012
5. Director (Border Management), Ministry of Home Affairs, New Delhi 15597/2012

Copy to:

20494/2012 PS to Hon'ble Minister (RD)/ Sr. PPS to Secretary (RD)/ PPS to AS&FA/ PS to JS(RC)/ Director (Tech.)/ Director (P-I)/ Director (P-II)/ Director (P-III),
20491/2012 Director (F&A), NRRDA/ Director (Technical), NIC.
20493/2012

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EMPOWERED COMMITTEE HELD ON 22nd
MARCH, 2012**

STATE: - Maharashtra

The Meeting of the Empowered Committee regarding clearance of Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana (PMGSY) project for Missing Bridges on already sanctioned roads, Left out habitations under Bharat Nirman (Dhule, Nandurbar & Nashik) and for New Connectivity for Habitations of 800-999 population category in Maharashtra was held on 22nd March, 2012 under the Chairmanship of Secretary (RD) in his chamber at New Delhi and was attended by the following :-

Shri S. Vijay Kumar	Secretary (RD)	Chairman
Dr. P.K. Anand	Joint Secretary (RC)	Member
Shri B.C. Behera	Deputy Secretary (Fin.)	
Shri S R Meena	Director (RC)	
Shri Rohit Kumar	Director (RC)	
Shri R. Chauhan	Director (F&A), NRRDA	
Shri I.K. Pateriya	Director-P.II, (Technical), NRRDA	
Shri N.C. Solanki	Director (P.I), NRRDA	
Shri D.T. Thube	Director (P-III)	

The State Government was represented by Shri Sudhir Thakre, Secretary, Rural Development & Panchayati Raj Department and Shri Ajit A. Sagane, Chief Engineer, Government of Maharashtra along with his team members.

2. A brief presentation was made by NRRDA on the present status of implementation of PMGSY in Maharashtra. The presentation, inter alia, brought out that:

- 16 roads of Phase V (out of 1530 works sanctioned), 24 roads of Phase VI (out of 439 works sanctioned), 54 roads of Phase VII (out of 128 works sanctioned), 228 roads of Phase VIII (out of 1057 works sanctioned) and 82 roads of Phase-IX (out of 154 sanctioned) are still incomplete.
- 3 road works, the proposals of which were not recommended by Empowered Committee, in its earlier meeting, being MDRs have been included once again in the current batch. PTA-IIT Mumbai has cleared the proposal.
- Provisions in the DPRs of the roads are not as per IRC SP 72: 2007. Average Cost per Km is very high for road works. DPRs need to be scrutinized at SRRDA level and corrected accordingly.
- One road work in the Proposal of Bharat Nirman and on two road works in 800-999 categories does not have a single benefitted habitation mapped on OMMAS.
- STAs have cleared the proposals with the note that the Geo-Technical investigations for Bridge works are in progress and the strata needs to be ensured before actual execution of work. Type of Strata may lead to change in design of foundation.
- As per Operation Manual, STAs and Superintending Engineer are supposed to have a combined visit, in case of Long Span Bridges. STAs have not certified that they visited any of the sites.
- Only few sample DPRs could be scrutinized. In some cases the Bridges have been designed for discharge much lower than that calculated in the DPRs. Such proposals

need to be identified and design corrected for maximum discharge, based on some other observations of NRRDA.

- Causeways and Bridges need to be separately identified as the Width permitted in each case is different.
- All the DPRs need to be verified in the field by the SRRDA officers, not below the rank of Superintending Engineer before giving Technical Sanction.
- There are substantial difference between figures of MPR and OMMAS.
- The quality trends based upon NQM inspection reports for the period January, 2009 to December, 2011 is increasing on completed road works. 520 ATR have been received out of required 559 ATRs.
- Sample inspections by NQMs indicate that 26% of the completed roads are being properly maintained and 31% of the completed roads are not being maintained at all.

3. in response, the Secretary, Rural Development & PR, Government of Maharashtra made the following observations:-

- (i) A compliance note would be submitted on the financial irregularities pointed out in the audit report of 2009-10 by April, 2012.
- (ii) Secretary (RD&PR), Government of Maharashtra informed Empowered Committee that the State Government will be able to complete remaining roads from Phase-V to Phase-IX up to June, 2012 except some of road works of Phase-VII and Phase-IX and road works pertaining to Gadchiroli (LWE affected) district.
- (iii) The State Government will incur adequate expenditure on maintenance of completed rural roads under PMGSY. An amount of Rs.28.12 crore has been spent on maintenance of rural roads in the current financial year.

4. Details of proposals considered by the Committee of Phase-X:

Item	Missing Bridges on already sanctioned roads	New Connectivity for Left out Bharat Nirman Habitations	New Connectivity for habitations under 800-999 population group	Total
Value in Rs Crores	389.50 *	64.19	5.33	459.02
No. of Road Works	452	7	3	452 Bridges 10 road works
Length in Km	18,514 mts	85.35	9.33	18,514 mts (LSB) 94.68 Km (Roads)
No of Habitations	-	1 of 1000+ 10 of 500+ 5 of 250+	3 of 500+ 1 of 250+	1 of 1000+ 13 of 500+ 6 of 250+
Avg. Cost per Km in Lakhs	2.11 per Km	74.69	57.12	73.42 (road works)

*** MoRD Share: Rs 358.099 Crores. State Share: Rs 31.465 Crores.**

5. Recommendations of the Committee:

The Empowered Committee recommended approval of the project proposals as detailed in Para 4 above. However, keeping in view the observations of NRRDA, clearance will be accorded after compliance of the observations made by the Empowered Committee.

6. While recommending these proposals, the Committee also made the following observations:

- (i) The provision for maintenance of PMGSY roads is very low i.e. 1.5% only for current batch of proposals. The State Government should enhance the same for the current batch of proposals from 1.5% to minimum 5%.
- (ii) The average cost per km in case of road projects is to be corrected based on the observations of NRRDA.
- (iii) State Government should strengthen Maintenance Management System in SRRDA and put in place adequate institutional arrangements and make provision of adequate funds for ensuring proper upkeep and maintenance of the projects completed under PMGSY and to incur adequate expenditure on maintenance of rural roads. State Government should include maintenance of rural roads from grant received from 13th Finance Commission of India
- (iv) Detailed Project Reports (DPRs) may be checked by STA/NRRDA particularly where where CBR is low and AADT is high.
- (v) Digital Photographs of field laboratories may also be taken and uploaded on the PMGSY's website along with 10 digital photographs of each road work of SQM's inspections.
- (vi) Road wise expenditure may be recorded on OMMAS and status of dropped road works may be uploaded on OMMAS.
- (vii) List of road works of all Phases with status may be prepared in booklet form (in English and local language) and sent to Ministry in the prescribed format.
- (viii) Adequate number of inspections by the 2nd tier Quality Monitors must be ensured. Stringent penal/disciplinary action may be taken against officials/contractors responsible in respect of completed projects having 'non-rectifiable defects'.
- (ix) The pace of implementation needs to be considerably accelerated in order to ensure timely completion of the ongoing works.
- (x) Financial Management System of SRRDA needs to be strengthened. Compliance on action taken on the financial irregularities pointed out in the audit report of 2009-10 and 2010-11 should be submitted to NRRDA.
- (xi) STAs and Superintending Engineer are expected to have a combined visit, in case of Long Span Bridges and should certify that the geotechnical investigations in case of bridges have been carried out and report included in the DPRs. A report should be sent to NRRDA.
- (xii) Causeways and Bridges need to be separately identified as the Width permitted in each case is different.
- (xiii) All the DPRs need to be verified in the field by the SRRDA officers, not below the rank of Superintending Engineer before giving Technical Sanction.
- (xiv) There are substantial difference between figures of MPR and OMMAS. This needs to be corrected before clearance letter is issued.

(xv) The quality trends based upon NQM inspection reports for the period January, 2009 to December, 2011 is increasing on completed road works. 520 ATRs have been received out of required 559 ATRs.

(xvi) Sample inspections by NQMs indicate that 26% of the completed roads are being properly maintained and 31% of the completed roads are not being maintained at all. The reasons for non maintaining the roads may be sent to the Ministry.

(xvii) Citizen Information Boards should be displayed in the local language and the Board should be placed in a prominent location in the benefited habitation for each road works being executed under the programme.

(xviii) The Executing Agency should re-check the BoQs and Estimates while giving technical sanction.

The Meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.
