National Rural Roads Development Agency Ministry of Rural Development, Government of India

Agenda for the 36th Meeting of the Executive Committee scheduled for 3rd August, 2015.

Item No.1	Confirm	Confirmation of the Minutes of the 35 th meeting of the Executive Committee of NRRDA and action taken thereon.					
	Proceedings of the previous meeting held on 14th July 2014, placed at Annex."A", were circulated amongst the members of the Executive Committee vide letter No.20011/1/2004/F&A dated 18.07.2014. No comments have been received from the members. It is proposed to confirm the Minutes of the previous meeting. Action taken on the Minutes is as follows:						
	Item No.1	Confirmation of the proceedings of the 35 th meeting of the Executive Committee and action taken thereon.					
	Item No.2	Opening of New Heads of Account in the Chart of Accounts of PMGSY Accounts Manual Programme Fundand Administrative Expenses Fund in respect of Centro Grant for PMGSY works routed through State Treasury.					
		1. Some of the States have entered into a tripartite					
		agreement with Nominated Executing Agencies					
		(NEAs) namely HSC Ltd, NBCC, NHPC, NPCC 8					
		IRCON, etc for executing the PMGSY work in the					
		selected Districts in their States. A clause of the					
		MoU stipulates the payment of Agency Fees @ o					
		10% of the total Project Cost to the respective NEA					
		In order to regulate the payment of Agency Fee:					
		to the NEAs as per the MoU and also to verify the					
		amount of Agency Fees received from the MoRD					
		a new sub head "Agency Fees to PSU" under the					
		existing Account Head No. 1.33- Central Grant fo					
		State Plan Schemes received by SRRDA through					
		State Treasury for PMGSY-in the Chart of Accounts					
		has been created, as detailed in Annexure-I.					
		2. Some of the PMGSY roads which were already					
		completed or ongoing have been damaged					
		washed away as a result of natural disaster which					

occurred in in Uttarakhand in June, 2013. The competent authority has approved one time replacement/ repair/ dispensation for reconstruction of these Roads. Such work falls into two categories; (a) Reconstruction of PMGSY roads earlier constructed, but washed away/ damaged as a result of extraordinary calamities (flood) and (b) Ongoing road works which have been washed away/ damaged as a result of extraordinary calamities (flood). PMGSY Accounts Manual Programme Fund does not provide the accounting classification for the aforesaid expenditure. A new head " 11.07- Special Works-Reparation **PMGSY** roads damaged completed extraordinary calamities etc" has been opened in the Chart of Accounts of PMGSY Account Manual Programme Fund. As regards (b) above the expenditure on repairs or reconstruction shall be charged to respective road package and revised estimates be got sanctioned from the competent authority for additional expenditure as detailed in Annexure II.

3. Cabinet has approved one-time special dispensation for Acquisition of Land covering compensatory a forestation, forest land, trees, private land and structures for completion of PMGSY Programme as per the original approved Core Network in the State of J&K. For this a new head "1.33-Central Grant for State Plan Schemes received by SRRDA through State Treasury for PMGSY-I Roads" has been opened in the Chart of Account of PMGSY Accounts Manual Programme Fund as detailed in Annexure III.

Item No.3

Approval of Annual Account of NRRDA for 2013-14. Approved in the General Body held on 19.12.2014.

Item No.4

Approval of Annual Report of NRRDA for the year 2013-14. Approved in the G.B. held on 19.12.2014.

Item No.5

Empanelment of new NQMs.

The Committee was informed that C.Vs of 25 applicants were perused by the Selection Committee during its meeting held on 9th June, 2014. Out of 25 applications, 7 candidates were recommended without any condition. another 5 candidates recommended subject to receipt of recommendation from the respective State Govts. and additional details in respect of 6 candidates were called for. Out of the remaining 7 candidates, 2 candidates were not considered for want of full details and 5 candidates were not recommended for empanelment for not fulfilling the selection criteria.

The Executive Committee took note of the recommendations of the Selection Committee and no further action is required.

Item No.6

Performance review of the existing NQMs.

Based on the observations of the Performance Evaluation Committee, the Selection Committee perused the cases of 20 NQMs. Out of 20 NQMs, 9 were rated as outstanding and satisfactory, 7 as marginal & 4 as unsatisfactory. The candidates rated as unsatisfactory are removed from the panel of NQMs.

The recommendations of the Selection committee were placed before the Executive Committee for its ratification. The Executive Committee while taking note of the performance review of the NQMs advised that the NQMs rated as outstanding may be sent a letter of appreciation.

		As per the advice of the Executive Committee,			
		letters of appreciation were sent to all NQMs rated as			
		'Outstanding'. No further action is required.			
	Item No.7	Re-Employment of Director (Projects) Shri N.C.Solanki. Re-employed upto 31.12.2014 and thereafter contract was terminated. No further action required.			
	Item No.8	NRRDA Internship Scheme for Young Professionals. Action will be initiated and will be put up for next E.C.meeting for consideration.			
	Item No.9	Approval for extension of foreign tour of Shri S.N.Srivastava. – T.A. Claim has been settled. No further action required.			
	Item No.10	Regularisation of HRA paid to Smt. Madhavi Vedula. Excess amount has been recovered. No further action required.			
Item No.III	Consideration of the recommendation of the 16th, 17th, & 18th Selection Committee Meetings for Empanelment of New NQMs.				
	Meetings of 16 th , 17 th & 18 th Selection Committee were held for empanelment of new NQMs. The details of the meetings held vis-à-vis recommendations made are given below: (i) 16 th Selection Committee Meeting held on 24 th December, 2014				
	made the a. 1 b. 1 re c. 4	mmittee deliberated upon the CVs of 32 candidates and following recommendations: 4 candidates recommended for empanelment as NQMs. 1 candidates recommended for empanelment subject to eceipt of recommendation from the respective State Governments/production of pension papers. candidates - road sector experience details to be obtained.			
		candidates - post retirement road sector experience letails to be obtained.			
		candidate - in service additional road sector experience letails to be obtained.			

(ii) 17th Selection Committee Meeting held on 27th March,2015

The Committee deliberated upon the CVs of 23 candidates and made the following recommendations:

- a. 02 candidates recommended for empanelment as NQMs.
- b. 08 candidates recommended for empanelment subject to receipt of recommendation from the respective State Governments/production of pension papers.
- c. 02 candidates post retirement road sector experience details to be obtained.
- d. 11 candidates Not recommended for non-fulfillment of selection criteria.

(iii) 18th Selection Committee Meeting held on 3rd July,2015

The Committee deliberated upon the CVs of 30 candidates and made the following recommendations:

- a. 07 candidates recommended for empanelment as NQMs.
- b. 09 candidates recommended for empanelment subject to receipt of recommendation from the respective State Governments/production of pension papers.
- c. 05 candidates in service/post retirement road sector experience details to be obtained.
- d. 08 candidates not recommended for non-fulfillment of selection criteria.
- e. 01 candidate C.V to be obtained in the prescribed format.

Details of candidates vis-a-vis., recommendations of the three Committees are given in the **Annexure IV**.

The above recommendations of the Selection Committee are submitted for ratification of the Executive Committee.

Item No.IV

Consideration of the phase II of Citizen Monitoring of Rural Roads under PMGSY – RRP-II.

Project Appraisal Document (PAD) for World Bank assisted PMGSY RRP-II project provides for support on citizen monitoring of roads under construction and post construction audit by a combination of trained cadres supervised by an independent NGO and local committees using pre-defined check lists. Accordingly Public Affairs Centre (PAC), a reputed Bangalore based NGO which has experience of development on citizen monitoring mechanism for urban areas, was approached.

Phase -I

Under Phase-I of the proposal costing approx. Rs. 43,54,511.00, three States viz., Jharkhand, Meghalaya and Rajasthan were covered. PAC facilitated monitoring of rural roads under PMGSY in these States with the help of its State level partner organizations. The goal of the intervention was to improve quality of roads by instituting citizens' checks during implementation of PMGSY scheme by training / capacity building of citizen volunteers with the required citizen friendly toolkit. The analysis of the data threw comprehensive light on the condition of roads in both the ongoing and completed stage from citizen perspective. The analytical report provided a basis for NRRDA/ concerned SRRDAs to take corrective actions and maintain the assets created under PMGSY. In the final report, PAC stated that there are some key inputs from pilot phase-I, which evolved with the progress of the project, and again; would be put to test in the next phase. It was also stated in the report that the learnings from the phase-I pilot project process sets the template for the coming phase.

Phase -11

Phase-II of the proposal aims at creating and empowering a self sustaining Citizen monitoring and Evaluation (Social Audit) platform in PMGSY. The Salient features of the Phase-II of the project are given below:

Objectives

- To evolve Took Kit, test and validate; to evolve data collection instruments, make them compatible with statistical software, test and validate; to evolve citizen training modules. Develop prototypes, AV/IEC content. Maximise Citizen Volunteer training outcomes.
- 2. Develop and synchronise GPS enabled Digital CRC with OMASS to augment/strengthen Citizen Monitoring process.
- Evolve, test and validate a 'model citizen monitoring process/methodology' that can be replicated/institutionalised in PMGSY implementation
- **4.** Put together a team of Master Trainers in each state, who would facilitate Citizen Monitoring of all PMGSY roads in respective states.

States to be covered:

Assam, Jharkhand, Karnataka, Meghalaya, Odisha, Rajasthan & Uttarakhand

Sample Size:

20 roads (including 10 ongoing and 10 completed) from each of the seven States would be taken up under the project.

Role of PAC

PAC, Bangalore would undertake the following activities in this study:

- Identifying partner organizations in the seven States for supporting this Project.
- Selection of PMGSY roads for monitoring with the help of SRRDAs and NRRDA.
- Finalizing and production of tools/modules for monitoring of quality of roads.
- Training and capacity building of volunteers to monitor the PMGSY Rural Roads.
- Facilitating the process of monitoring PMGSY Rural Roads as per this Project.
- Facilitation of training of Master Trainers
- Acting as nodal agency (coordinating all the activities as in Schedule 1)

Key deliverables from PAC:

- 1. Renewed Tool kit, Data capturing and analysing tools.
- 2. Educational documentary
- 3. Prototype model
- 4. IEC posters for rural citizen
- 5. Citizen Monitoring Handbook
- 6. Reinforced hands-on citizen volunteer training module.
- 7. Volunteer workshops where 420 citizen volunteers, 21 SLPO personnel and 14 SIRD personnel are trained.
- 8. Six Master Trainers in each state (42 in all)
- PMGSY grama sabhas (minimum of 140) where rural citizen are empowered with total information on PMGSY roads.
- 10. Reports
 - a. Volunteer training completion report.
 - b. First round audit report.
 - c. Final report (after state level consultations) with Model PMGSY Citizen Monitoring process

Timeline of the Project

The project would be completed by May, 2016.

Cost

Rs. 2,58,52,920 (Rupees two crore fifty eight lakhs fifty two thousand nine hundred twenty).

Status of Progress

i) Selection of State Level Partner Organizations (SLPOs):

PAC have identified and selected SLPOs for all the seven States viz., Karuna Trust (Assam), Nave Bharat Jagriti Kendra (Jharkhand), Viveka Nanda Institute for Leadership Development (Karnataka), Karuna Trust (Meghalaya), Centre for Youth and Social Development (Odisha), Gramin Vikas Vigyan Samiti (Rajasthan) and Central Himalayan Environmental Association (Uttarakhand)

ii) Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with SLPOs:

Draft MoUs have been vetted by MoRD & World Bank.

iii) Toolkit and Road Model:

140 toolkits and 10 road prototypes are being prepared and will be delivered to PAC by end of July, 2015.

iv) Questionnaire:

Changes made based on discussions with NRRDA & World Bank held in the meetings at Bengaluru on 31st June and 1st July, 2015. The revised questionnaire vetted by NRRDA.

v) Introductory letters Secretary RD & PR of all the States:

Already sent.

vi) Letters with specific areas requiring SRRDAs assistance and assistance of PRIs.

Already sent.

vii) Questionnaire/agenda for focus group discussions aiming at awareness of Citizens:

This is being prepared by PAC and will be ready by end of July, 2015.

viii) IEC Material:

First draft on Citizen Awareness and hand book for voluntaries is being prepared by PAC and will be ready by end of July, 2015.

World Bank has given their approval for the project. The expenditure on the project is proposed to be borne from the 'Research & Development (R&D) head of NRRDA. This requires the approval of Executive Committee. Para 21 (b) of NRRDA Bye-laws states that the Executive Committee shall exercise all executive and financial powers of the Agency, subject to such directions as may be issued by the Government of India and General Body from time to time. Further, para 21(d) of the Bye-laws provides that the EC may delegate any of its powers to the Director General.

Para 23 (g) of the Bye-laws, states that the Director General shall exercise the powers of the Executive Committee of the Agency in the interregnum between two Meetings of the Executive Committee. All decisions taken by the Chairman, acting in such capacity shall be placed in the next Meeting of the Executive Committee for ratification. Accordingly, the approval of Director General-cum-Chairman of the Executive Committee has been taken.

The matter is now placed before the Executive Committee for its ratification.

Item No.V

Consideration of the proposed revised norms (alongwith justification for the same) for STAs & PTAs.

Revision of Honorarium to State Technical Agencies

On different occasions STA's have requested for revision of remuneration in view of the efforts that are being put in by them in comprehensive scrutiny of proposals as well as fulfilling the other duties like providing guidance through interaction with the Field Engineers of the respective PIUs. Further, random field checks in case of aberrations in the design parameters is also entrusted to the STAs which warrants more time and efforts on the part of the STAs.

In Recommendation No. 3 of Mckinsey Report the STA's demand for increase in their remuneration has been supported. NRRDA has accepted the recommendations of Mckinsey Report.

 Earlier in 2006 the remuneration for the STAs for scrutiny of project proposal under PMGSY was allowed as per details given below:

Rs. 5-50 Crores	Rs. 51-200 Crores	Rs. 201 Crd
		above
0.03% subject to a	0.0225% subject to	0.015% to
minimum of Rs. 30,000	a minimum of Rs.	minimum of Rs. 4
	1,50,000	

The breakup of the remuneration to each STA is as follows:

- a) Up to Rs. 20,000 towards Contingencies for the Coordinator STA, based on actual.
- b) Out of the remaining amount, 30% is for the institutional overheads.
- c) Balance amount is the honorarium for the members of the STA including Coordinator, as recommended by the STA Coordinator based on the contribution of the individual members.
- In view of the above acceptance the Technical Division has proposed revision of remuneration for STAs as under:

Rs. 5-150 Crores	Rs. 151-200 Crores	Rs. 201 Cro
		above
0.045% subject to	0.03375% subject	0.0225% st
a minimum of Rs. 50,000	to a minimum of Rs.	a minimum of Rs
	2,50,000	6,00,000

The breakup of the remuneration to each STA is as follows:

- a) Up to Rs. 30,000 towards Contingencies for the Coordinator STA, based on actual.(Presently Rs. 20,000/-)
- b) Out of the remaining amount, 30% is for the institutional overheads.

- c) Balance amount is the honorarium for the members of the STA including Coordinator, as recommended by the STA Coordinator based on the contribution of the individual members.
- 4. Further the proposed remuneration will be paid based on performance evaluation of each STA as per the details given below. This was also agreed upon by DG, NRRDA and also accepted by the General Body.

Marks obtained in Performance Evaluation	Grade	Propose d Revised Remuneration	
81-100	Α	100%	
61-80	В	80%	
50-60	С	60%	
<50	D	50%*	

*The STAs who obtain 'D' grade may be continued for current year. However, if such STAs do not improve their grade following the year in which 'D' has been given; they may be recommended for discontinuation.

- 5. The review of reports of STAs shall be carried out by the members of Performance Evaluation Committee constituted by NRRDA. The following parameters are considered for performance evaluation of STAs.
 - 1. Observations on planning and project selection
 - 2. Observations on topographic survey and traffic survey
 - 3. Observations on soil and material survey
 - 4. Observations on pavement design
 - 5. Observations on Geometrics
 - 6. Observations on drainage design
 - 7. Observations on provision of Cross Drainage Structures and Protection works
 - 8. Observations on estimate of quantities of items of work
 - 9. Observations on Social and Environmental Aspects

- 10. Observations on Specifications, construction programmes and maintenance
- 11. Observations on Online Clearance of Proposals on OMMAS
- 12. Observations on STA Team and its functioning
- 13. Special conditions
 - 1. Marking in case of Contradictory remarks
 - 2. Marks for not recording any observations
 - Marks in case of Incorrect scrutiny and clearance of DPRs

Performance rating of the STA would depend on the average of marks obtained in all the evaluated reports.

STA wise DPRs scrutinised during 2011-12, 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15 is attached.

Maximum value of DPRs scrutinised by a STA (Rs. In crores) in last 4 years – Rs.2847.87

Minimum value of DPRs scrutinised by a STA (Rs. In crores) in last 4 years – Rs. 1.34

Average value of DPRs scrutinised by a STA (Rs. In crores) in last 4 years – Rs. 298.07

Maximum value of DPRs scrutinised by :MIT, Mazaffarpur Minimum value of DPRs scrutinised by : GCE, Jabalpur

The Executive Committee is requested to approve the proposal.

	Abstract						
SI .No	Details	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15		
	Maximum value of DPRs scrutinised by a STA (Rs. In crore)	1048.03	1435.7	2847.87	385.16		
	Minimum value of DPRs scrutinised by a STA (Rs. In crore)	1.34	2.88	15.29	5.41		
	Average value of DPRs scrutinised by a STA (Rs. In crore)	227.83	430.27	403.35	130.84		
	Maximum value of DPRs scrutinised by:	VSSUT, Burla	MANIT, Bhopal	MIT, Mazaffarpur	Manipur Institute of Technolog Imphal, Manipur State		
	Minimum value of DPRs scrutinised	GEC, Jabalpur	Bangalore University	BIT Mesra	GZS College of Engineering and Technolog		

Item Consideration of the proposed enhancement of PCI verification costs by third party under PMGSY – RRP-II.

by:

Fixation of Cost norms for the Verification of Pavement Condition Index (PCI) survey data by Independent Consultant.

Technolog

Punjab

In order to manage the rural road network for upgradation and maintenance planning, all States are advised to carry out on a continuing basis with a 2-year cycle, a Pavement Condition Survey of the District Rural Road Networks (DRRP). The PCI is an

integral part of the OMMAS and each PIU shall enter this data for each Km in the OMMAS database which will helps for selection of roads under PMGSY and also to carryout maintenance activities.

The selection of roads under PMGSY-II is mainly based on the Pavement Condition Index (PCI) of roads and verification of PCI is important to utilise the funds in the proper way and to maintain the good rural road network, at all times.

Ministry has already issued letter No. P-14018/01/2009/P-1 dated 09.07.2014, for carrying out PCI survey based on the visual inspection or driving speed or riding comfort to the sophisticated mechanised system (by using Roughometer or Bump integrator) to achieve the accuracy of the PCI data and also the States are permitted to incur expenditure of upto Rs. 50/Km for carrying out such survey for PMGSY roads. In this regard, Ministry has also directed the States for the appointment of Independent consultant for verification of Pavement Condition Index survey data of Rural Roads on random basis.

There is a need to fix rates for verification of PCI of rural roads by visual as well as equipments as use of Pump Integrator and Roughometer. It may not be possible for the verification of entire length of rural road network by using equipments. Hence, it is proposed that,

- about 10% of Core Network length may be cross verified by the third party ie STA/PTA/Consultants by using visual observations.
- about 1 to 2% of the Core Network length may be cross verified by the third party ie STA/PTA/Consultants by using equipments.

Andhara Pradesh has sent a proposal for engaging Independent Consultants for verification of PCI data and requested to approve the quotation of Rs. 640/Km for verification of PCI data by visual observations which seems to be high.

Cost norms for engaging independent consultants for the audit of Pavement Condition Index survey data is required to be fixed at this stage.

- Verification of PCI data by visual observations about Rs. 200/Km.
- 2. Verification of data by using roughometer/ or Bump integrator about Rs. 400/Km.

The Executive Committee is requested to approve the proposal.

Item No.VII

Ratification of use of services of empanelled advocate Shri Mayank Yadav for legal matters of NRRDA.

As per Order dated 30.12.2014 issued by Ministry of Law & Justice, Department of Legal Affairs (Annex-V) Shri Mayank Yadav has been empanelled for conducting the Central Government litigation before the Court/Tribunal. The name of Shri Mayank Yadav is listed at SI.No.42 of the above mentioned Order. The Bio-data of Shri Mayank Yadav is at Annex. VI. Shri Mayank Yadav has already been approached by NRRDA with the approval of DG, NRRDA for legal advice on the following matters:-

- Ram Kishna Malik & Other (Petitioner) Vs. State of West Benal and Others. (Writ Petition No.34282 (W) of 2014 in the High Court at Calcutta).
- 2. SLP (Civil 24316 dated 20.11.2014 in Hon'ble Supreme Court of India.
- 3. Shri Sunil Kukreja, Ex. Jt. Director Vs. Union of Indfia & Others OA No.2115/2015 filed in Principal Bench, CAT, Delhi.
- on Execution of Sub-Lease Deed between NRRDA and NBCC.
- Md. Rahul Amin V/s the Union of India & Ors.
 (W.P.No.33465(W) of 2014 in High Court, Kolkatta.

The charges payable to Shri Mayank Yadav will be as per relevant guidelines issued by Ministry of Law & Justice. So far no remuneration has been paid by NRRDA to Shri Yadav.

The Executive Committee is requested to ratify the use of services of empanelled advocate Shri Mayak Yadav.

ltem No.VIII	Ratification of New Central Public Information Officer (CPIO) and Women Welfare Officer (WWO) in NRRDA:							
	The NRRDA vide Office Order No. 16.7.2015 has declared Shri P.Mohanasundram, Jt. Direct(Tech) as CPIO and Ms. Shalini Das, AD(Tech) as Women Welfare Officer vide this office Office Order No.A37011/9(551)2006/F&A/2959 dated 16.7.2015 (Copies of Office Orders Enclosed (Annex.VII) The information has also been uploaded on NRRDA'website "www.pmgsy.nic.in".							
Item No.IX		on on Internal Audit the O/CCA,RD.	Report regarding	overpaymen	T			
	20.05.2015 had made to certa		ayment/inadmiss . Action has bee	ible payment en initiated for				
	Name	Designation	Audit observation	Action taken				
	Shri N.C.Solanki	Director(P-I)	Overpayment for Rs.59,520/- on a/c.of wrong fixation of pay.	Amount recovered.				
	Dr.I.K.Pateriya,	Jt.Director(Tech.)	Excess drawal of deputation allowance for Rs.1,26,785/- and drawal of foreign TA/DA Rs. 20,519/	Officer has been pursued to deposit the amount.				
	Shri Sunil Kukreja	Jt.Director(F&A)	Overpayment for Rs.3.25 lacs on a/c.of wrong fixation of pay.	Amount recovered.				
	Ms.Madhavi Vedula	Asstt.Director (Tech.)	Overpayment of Rs.2.98 lacs on account of drawal of H.R.A.	Amount recovered.				
	Shri Arun Singhal	Principal Secretary,RDD,Govt.of UP.	Excess payment on foreign tour to Paris for Rs.7394.00	Officer has been requested vide letter dt.11.6.2015 to deposit the amount				
		PC and a land						

Shri		Principal Secretary,	Excess payment	Officer has
J.C.A	Mohanti	MedicAl Edu.Dept. Govt.of Rajasthan	on foreign tour to Paris for Rs.7394.00	been requested vide letter dt.11.6.2015 to deposit the amount

Reminders will be issued to the Officers and defaulters to refund the amount.